Work Capability Assessment: deaths and suicides

“I say to those watching today and who are genuinely sick, disabled or are retired. You have nothing to fear. This government and this party don't regard caring for the needy as a burden. It is a proud duty to provide financial security to the most vulnerable members of our society and this will not change. This is our contract with the most vulnerable.”

Iain Duncan Smith - October 2010

Introduction

The Work Capability Assessment is the assessment (initially carried out by Atos) that was introduced as part of the Government’s ‘reforms’ to Incapacity Benefit. The Work Related Activity Group is defined as a group for people whose condition makes it unreasonable to require them to work. The Support Group is for people with more severe levels of disability who are considered to have limited capability even for work related activity.

Very quickly stories emerged of the terrible impact that the assessment was having on people’s lives. In particular, many people have been found fit to work despite severe and diagnosed health conditions. Some people have taken their own lives and many have died shortly after this assessment.

The following testimony is taken directly from two produced reports produced by the Spartacus Network:


For reference purposes this document is:


The short-link to access this file is bit.ly/WCA-deaths

For more information go to: www.spartacusnetwork.org.uk

Author: Spartacus Network
Publisher: We Are Spartacus
Revised Version Published: 28th April 2015
Published deaths and suicides

Larry Newman attended a work capability assessment when a degenerative lung condition made it impossible for him to go on working. The Atos staff member who carried out the medical test awarded him zero points. He received a letter stating that he was not eligible for ESA and would be fit to return to work within three months. Before three months was up he died from his lung problems.

Two claimants died from the conditions which caused them to claim Incapacity Benefit while waiting for their appeals to be heard:

One was deemed fit for work during a work capability assessment, despite having a deteriorating chronic illness, and lost both incapacity benefit and disability living allowance. When his support worker appeared at the appeal tribunal she had to report her client could not be there because he was dead.

The other had a congenital condition which caused difficulty in walking but was assessed capable of work and his incapacity benefit was withdrawn. He was waiting for a date for an appeal tribunal when he died.

A third person could not work due to severe heart and lung problems caused by a degenerative syndrome. He died recently after winning a second appeal tribunal following three years of repeated assessments and decisions being overturned.

George worked all his life, first as a miner and foundry worker, then as a communications engineer, until a heart attack in 2006 when he was 53. In George's 39-minute exam, the "disability analyst" noted that George had angina, heart disease and chest pain, even when resting. But this wasn't "uncontrollable or life-threatening" and George "should be able to walk at least 200 metres".

He appealed, waiting eight months for his case to go to an independent tribunal. He was put in the Work Related Activity Group. But months later George collapsed and died of a heart attack, the day before another Atos medical. His widow is convinced the stress of claiming killed him.

A man with mental health problems who was worried about benefit cuts killed himself while he was searching for a job. A suicide letter and next of kin note were found in which he expressed concerns about Government cuts.
The police are not looking for anyone else in connection with the deaths of Mark and Helen Mullins, from Bedworth in Warwickshire. One theory is they may have committed suicide. Before their death Mark said:

"Helen is learning disabled, but it took her a very long time to get any kind of benefits or social security. The job centre decided that she couldn't sign on because she wasn't capable - she had no brain functions, no numeracy, literacy skills."

"But the incapacity people... wouldn't recognise her until she had been fully diagnosed, which meant month after month after month of specialists. So basically we were caught in a Catch-22 situation. I think the system is very unkind. We have lost count of how many appeals we have had. We've had to fight tooth and nail every step of the way to get benefits."

Neighbours said before they died, the couple were living in one room because they could not afford to heat their home.

† † †

A young man explained how his uncle, who had severe mental health problems, committed suicide after the test gave him zero points and found him fit to work. He had appealed against the decision, and won at tribunal. But shortly after that decision, he was called in for another assessment, and for a second time scored zero points and was told he did not. He began appealing against the decision again, but a few days before another tribunal date was set, he hanged himself.

† † †

The body of Elaine Christian, 57, was found in Holderness Drain by a mother returning from a school run. A post mortem revealed she had died from drowning, despite having more than ten self-inflicted cuts on her wrists. The inquest in Hull was told Mrs Christian had been worrying about a meeting she was due to have to discuss her entitlement to disability benefits.

† † †

Friends of an acclaimed Scottish writer have accused the government's crackdown on welfare benefits of being a factor in his suicide. Paul Reekie killed himself in his Edinburgh home last month. The writer and poet, who was 48, left no suicide note but friends say letters informing him that his welfare benefits were to be halted were found close to his body. One was notifying him that his housing benefit had been stopped. The other was notifying him that his incapacity benefit had been stopped.

† † †

Police have confirmed a body found in the River Wear five weeks ago is that of the 30-year-old, who disappeared five months ago. Leanne, who had battled depression for a number of years, had taken a turn for the worse after receiving a letter telling her she had to be assessed by a doctor to see if she was fit to return to work.

† † †
My Daughter was deemed fit for work in November, she was so worried about losing her flat, she had to sell her Jewellery to get heat and food, given to her by family.

“It broke her Heart, my Daughter was 36 on the 9th of March 2012 and had died in her sleep on the 12th of March, post mortem showed nothing, inquest in May. When I ring DHSS they keep sending me from pillar to post, sent in a complaint no reply, not giving up, will carry on until I get an explanation, My Beautiful Daughter is gone, and my heart is broken

† † †

“Behind every statistic is a person. I personally knew one of the 1100 people that died while in the Work Related Activity Group of ESA that the writers of the [Daily Mirror] article above have talked about. And I sat holding the hand of this lady who was in the Work Related Activity Group of ESA, and I kissed her goodbye the day before she died. And as a support worker, among the many other things I had to deal with after she died, I had to write to the local 'back to work service' to tell them she would not be attending any more mandatory 'work-focussed interviews'."

† † †

“Do you think it's ok for a person dying of cancer to be forced to work for £70 per week benefit in their local Poundland? Do you think it's ok to be served in MacDonalds by someone who has a Hickman Line in? Does anyone out there actually know what a Hickman Line is? Not the DWP clearly…”

† † †

“My brother died 4 days after having his medical. I went with him to it and saw how terrified he was. He had Aspergers and I have seen some links saying he didn't need to attend in the first place. He died of an aortic dissection, brought on by high blood pressure - I'm convinced raised fatally due to the thought of the assessment. At present I am trying to get the notes from the meeting but not getting anywhere.”

† † †

“My father David Groves was at his second appeal tribunal that he was due to attend the day before he died. He was trying his upmost to sell any assets that he had built up over his life time, the family caravan, his car, and anything else of value to try and raise fund to keep a roof over his head, because he knew that this system was going to fail him. Those that have said that is was not the Government that killed him - speak to my mother who found him dead at the computer getting the best price for his assets.”

† † †
Martin Rust, 36, was declared fit to work following a Department of Work and Pensions assessment in September, two months before he was found dead at his home in Parmentergate Court in the city centre on November 21. Coroner William Armstrong said the DWP’s decision “caused distress and may well have had an adverse effect”, recording that Mr Rust had committed suicide while suffering from a treatment-resistant mental illness.

† † †

A man who had “significant worries” was found hanging in his home by a neighbour, a Burnley inquest heard. Craig Monk who was described by his family as “vulnerable” had previously taken overdoses of anti-depressants and painkillers. Neighbour Kevin Martin said the last time he saw Mr Monk he was worried that his benefits had been cut.

† † †

Stephen Hill, 53, of Duckmanton, died in December of a heart attack. The dad-of-two had suffered heart problems for around two years and was awaiting major heart surgery but following a ten-minute medical examination on November 17 he was deemed well enough to work.

Mr Hill’s brother Anthony, 52, said: “I think the worry put so much pressure on him. Mr Hill’s family – and Chesterfield MP Toby Perkins – are now calling for Atos’ ‘tick box’ system to be overhauled.

† † †

Mark Scott, 46, who suffered from anxiety, epilepsy and chronic alcoholism, was left penniless when Job Centre doctors said he was fit to work. He was deprived of oxygen as a baby which left him prone to epileptic fits and panic attacks. He died on January 26 in the Southport flat where he lived alone. His father told the ECHO:

“I think the anxiety Mark suffered over this decision killed him. They pulled the rug from under him and I think the stress of it led to his death. I want to fight for justice, not just for Mark but for all the other people in the same situation. If I am offered the money I won’t take it, I will give it to charity. I just want the DWP to realise the impact of what they are doing.”

An independent tribunal ruled the decision to stop Mr Scott’s employment support allowance was incorrect.

† † †
Karen Sherlock, 44, was put in the Work Related Activity Group in 2010. Where she was required to attend interviews, work-related activity etc. She suffered from Diabetic Autonomic Neuropathy (gastric causing unpredictable and severe diarrhoea), Gastroparesis (causing unpredictable and severe bouts of vomiting), Diabetic Retinopathy, partially sighted (loss of peripheral vision in both eyes and some central vision in left eye), Heart condition, Chronic Kidney Disease, Vitamin B12 Deficiency, Anaemia, Hypertension, High Cholesterol, Hypothyroidism, Asthma and Chronic tiredness due to multiple illnesses.

Her husband Nigel said it was a disgrace she was refused benefits and said her battle finally took its toll on her health.

Last year she lost a long process of appeal against the decision but continued her campaign. In April 2012, as a result of the time-limiting of ESA to one year, her £96-a-week benefits were stopped, plunging her into despair as her health deteriorated. She won her appeal a few weeks ago and she was finally put in the Support Group.

She died eight days later on June.

Colin Traynor suffered from grand mal epilepsy from the age of 14 months. Although he was prescribed medication, his condition was never controlled. He was unable to do normal things that some of us take for granted such as go out to work, drive a car and even socialising with friends.

After doing everything to try and find employment for Colin, Remploy told him his condition was so severe that he was deemed unemployable. After 9 years of trying Colin eventually came to terms with the fact that he would never be able to work.

After a WCA Colin was found fit for work in January 2012 and would have his benefit cut by £70 a week. He was advised an appeal could take 9 months. Colin's health deteriorated, his seizures increased due to the stress and he also lost a lot of weight. On the 3rd of April 2012 the stress and anxiety he was suffering from resulted in a massive seizure which took his life. Colin died at home, on his own. He was only 29 years of age.

Paul Turner, a manager and proud family man, contracted a serious heart disease. He was off work and although desperate to work, could not do so. However, he was told that he was fit for work and was denied benefit. As his wife says, he went into serious decline and died only weeks later. In the work capability assessment, his heart was not tested: does that not demonstrate how fundamentally flawed the assessment process and its conduct by Atos are?
The death of a young woman who killed herself after being found “fit for work” is the latest proof of the catastrophic consequences of the government’s cuts to disability benefits and services. A friend of the woman said her suicide letter said she had been found “fit for work”, and could not face a future without any money. Her mother also killed herself, just 24 hours after hearing of her daughter’s death. Her devastated family have stressed that they do not want their names passed to the media.

† † †

“My partner died last week of kidney cancer. He was diagnosed a year ago and at Christmas was told he had about four months to live. In the spring he was summoned for a work capability assessment (by this time he had two brain tumours) and found fit for work. In addition to everything else, he became anxious about losing the small amount of money he was living on. On May 19th he received a letter from Job Centre plus telling him he was to be tested as having limited capability for work. The medical officer overseeing his case had advised that “death within six months is unlikely to occur due to the client’s cancer” and there would be no “substantial risk to his mental or physical wellbeing if he were found capable of work-related activity.”

† † †

Janet McCall aged 53 had pulmonary fibrosis and scarring of the lungs - she was struggling to breathe. In the summer of 2011 an Atos doctor did a home assessment and declared her fit for work. Five months later in January 2012, she died.

† † †

A former farm labourer shot himself after learning that his benefits were being stopped, an inquest heard. He was found dead in his front garden with a shotgun at his feet by his neighbour. A statement from his doctor said they had spoken on the phone and he had been upset because his benefits were being stopped after an annual assessment as he did not have the required number of points to qualify. The Coroner said his death had been a deliberate act and that he had killed himself and the main factor worrying him was that his benefits had been stopped.

† † †

“The Prime Minister will know of the many injustices that have been meted out by Atos in the past few years. They were mentioned again on Monday at Department for Work and Pensions questions. The latest victim was a farmer and a butcher in Bolsover who went to Atos in December 2012 and was stripped of his benefit. For 11 months he waited for an appeal and then his aggressive cancer took his sight, took his hearing, and then last Friday took his life.” [Dennis Skinner MP]
“My brother died at 1pm today. He needed a liver transplant because he contracted Hepatitis C which attacked his liver. This was 4 years ago. He always worked, paid his dues, but still lost his house and everything he worked for. He was told he was fit to work and they cut his benefits. The worry and stress of not having enough to live on did not help him fight the illness. He made himself bankrupt to ward off his debtors (mortgage company) in particular and has had an horrendous last couple of months, with his health failing. He had to be drained of fluid every couple of weeks because his liver was not working properly which was not a pleasant experience. He was on a ventilator for the past week and had 7 drips going into him, with tubes inserted to take away his waste and fluid that was on his lungs.”

“A friend of mine killed herself last week, another local man committed suicide a few weeks ago both due to being messed around with their benefits. I see vulnerable people scared to death and living in fear. Another friend of mine had his benefits stopped, shortly afterwards he had to have an emergency operation, he’s recovering but he has no income, he seen his Doctor who wrote him a sick note for 6 months, it just goes on. The Government should apply the brakes on this shambles NOW!”

A mother of three died of a brain tumour just weeks after Atos told her she should be looking for a job. Despite telling Atos about her serious health problems, including epilepsy, she was put in the WRAG. A scan then showed her tumour had returned and this time was terminal. She died in a hospice within weeks.

A woman died after suffering a massive brain haemorrhage in April. Despite her partner immediately informing them of her death, the day after she died, the DWP continued to send her letters asking her to attend appointments to discuss her claim for ESA. When she failed to attend, she received more letters demanding to know why she had not been present.

A diabetic man and triple amputee was found dead in his house just months after being called for an assessment. He believed an assessment was unnecessary.

A man died whilst waiting for a hearing for his third appeal against a wrong decision On two previous occasions the tribunal decided that he had reduced awareness of everyday hazards, leading to a significant risk of injury to him or others, and was therefore not fit for work.
A seriously ill woman died two days after trying to kill herself when she was told her incapacity benefit would be stopped. Westminster coroner’s court was told she had received a letter from the DWP saying she should go back to work. The 53-year-old, who suffered breathlessness because of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, was so distressed she took a cocktail of drugs.

She recovered after treatment in hospital, but she died two days later from her existing condition. The Coroner said quality of life was poor due to chest disease and lung problems,” said the coroner. “I am satisfied the drugs found in her system are a red herring. I am going to record the cause of her death as chest disease and conclude that she died from natural causes.”

A man who had a serious blood disorder, had blood clots in both lungs, two deep vein thromboses in his legs and had to have his big toe amputated, was diagnosed with Hughes syndrome, a life-threatening condition. He had been left without money by the Benefits Agency for 10 weeks, despite being signed off as unfit to work by the doctor. He committed suicide and was found by his fiancee when she got up in the morning.

A 47 year old man overdosed on a cocktail of drugs after he had his benefits stopped because he was not given a proper medical assessment by the Department for Work and Pensions, an inquest heard. [His]family told the Post they considered the decision to stop his benefits was a "major trigger" in a spiral which led him to overdose on heroin, cocaine and alcohol.

[He] was told his benefits of £90-a-week would be stopped on...the same day he took to social networking site Facebook to vent his frustration at Prime Minister David Cameron and Atos – the company which carries out medical assessments on behalf of the Department for Work and Pensions.

After writing of his disapproval of the system he wrote on Facebook: "It's time to say goodbye, goodbye."

At his inquest, which lasted two days, the court heard that [his] medical assessment took just 23 minutes and his allowance was stopped despite him suffering from HIV, hepatitis C, sciatica, severe depression, insomnia and dental pain. The Nottinghamshire coroner, Miss Mairin Casey, branded it a "crude assessment". She said: "I find the assessment process in Edward’s case did not fully or properly reflect Edward's physical and mental health at that time.

A DWP spokesman said: "Our sympathy goes out to the family of Mr Jacques. A decision on whether someone is well enough to work is taken following a thorough assessment and after consideration of all supporting medical evidence from the claimant's GP or medical specialist."
“My partner’s father had severe emphysema and heart problems, he also had numerous heart attacks and constant infection due to his immune system being so low, the poor man couldn't even walk from one side of the house to another without needing his oxygen yet he was made to go to appeal for both his ESA and his DLA, he won both appeals after turning up to the appeal in a wheelchair with his oxygen mask on his face, a few months later he was told it was to stop and he would have to appeal again, the amount of stress and worry it caused was unimaginable, my partner’s mom was his full time carer so she couldn't work either, he needed 24 hour care. Unfortunately he passed away last year whilst waiting for the appeal.

† † †

A man was found hanging at his home just a day after he received a text message telling him to attend the Job Centre. He had previously sent his partner of 13 years, a text saying: “I give up.” He had been unable to work after he suffered a brain haemorrhage and a stroke and had his leg fused following a football injury. He wore a calliper and couldn’t grip with his hand. He had been worried that if he didn't take some sort of work, his benefits would be stopped.

His partner said “The text scared him so much. He had been depressed for years but he could keep that under control. It was the text which pushed him over. I want people to realise the effect of these changes on people’s lives. These changes are terrifying to vulnerable people and their concerns need to be listened to. It can have a devastating effect on people’s lives. As someone said after Peter died, he won’t be the first person to die because of this, and he won’t be the last.”

The message didn't state a date but a subsequent letter was sent days after his death.

† † †

A woman suffered from arthritis in her neck and back due to slipped discs, her pain was exacerbated after an unsuccessful operation on her neck last year. She was left in agony every time one of her arms was touched, making everyday tasks a huge challenge. Bones from her hand had been removed during separate surgery after she had been attacked by a dog. Despite being in agony which strong pain relief could not ease, she was deemed to be fit for work following a government health assessment and told to seek work. Her sister, a nurse, claims the verdict that she was ineligible for disability benefits drove her to take her own life. She was found dead at her home having taken an overdose.

A tribunal hearing, following an initial appeal, had been due to take place to consider her appeal two weeks later. Her sister said she spent two hours on two buses travelling to the assessment centre, run by private firm Atos Healthcare, and spent only two minutes having an assessment. She said her sister was only asked one question at the assessment: “Did you get here by bus?... She replied with one fateful word – 'yes'. She hadn't even had the chance to take her coat off... Anyone could see she wasn't fit to work. She would have loved to have had a job but couldn't. How much grief, pain and anguish do you have to go through before they realise?”

† † †
Suicide Guidelines Issued - Staff working for Job Centres and other Department for Work and Pensions contractors have been given guidelines on how to deal with suicide threats from claimants as the squeeze on benefits takes hold. A document sent to Job Centre staff in April details what it calls a "new policy for all DWP businesses to help them manage suicide and self-harm declarations from customers". The internal document was sent to the Guardian by a senior Job Centre employee who has worked for the DWP for more than 20 years. It was accompanied by a letter from the source that said: "Absolutely nobody has ever seen this guidance before, leading staff to believe it has been put together ahead of the incapacity benefit and disability living allowance cuts."

Recent developments

Since the two Reviews were published reports of deaths and suicides keep coming.

There is another archive of deaths, including more recent tragedies, kept here: Benefit tales, stories from the frontline of benefit changes in the UK in 2013.

https://welfaretales.wordpress.com/category/death/
https://welfaretales.wordpress.com/category/death-after-fit-to-work-decision/

More than 2,300 died after fit for work assessment - DWP figures

Almost 600 Suicides Could Be Related To DWP Work Assessments, Claims New Research
http://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/2015/11/16/dwp-suicides-assessments-research_n_8577038.html

Stephen Carré scandal: DWP ‘finds’ draft report that was never sent to coroner
http://www.disabilitynewsservice.com/stephen-carre-scandal-dwp-finds-draft-report-that-was-never-sent-to-coroner

The Mental Welfare Commission for Scotland’s report Who Benefits? sought the views of 70 psychiatrists on how the WCA was affecting patients.

It revealed 13% of doctors had at least one patient who had attempted suicide as a result of the assessment process, while 35% had patients admitted to hospital. 96% of psychiatrists said they had at least one patient who was distressed after an assessment, 85% said it had led to patients needing more frequent appointments, and 65% had patients needing stronger medication.


The Information Commissioner’s Office has now launched an investigation into DWP’s failure to provide information on 49 secret reviews into benefit-related deaths since February 2012. Of the 49 “peer reviews”, it later emerged that 33 contained recommendations for improvements in procedures at either national or local level.
within DWP, while 40 of the 49 reviews were carried out following the suicide or apparent suicide of a benefit claimant.

Despite Freedom of Information requests from Disability News Service, and others, DWP has refused to publish the reviews, or their summaries, recommendations or conclusions, even with personal details of benefit claimants removed.

http://www.disabilitynewsservice.com/information-watchdog-to-probe-dwps-secret-reviews-on-benefit-deaths/

The Work and Pensions Committee have called for an "urgent", full review established by the Department for Work and Pensions (DWP), into benefit conditionality. It also adds, that a new independent body should be created – similar to the Independent Police Complaints Commission – that would investigate instances where failures of the DWP may have contributed to the death of a claimant.

http://www.newstatesman.com/uk-politics/2015/03/work-and-pensions-committee-calls-independent-investigation-benefit-sanctions

The Department for Work and Pensions has now refused to answer any questions from the country’s only disability news agency, which has reported on many of the issues relating to the Work Capability Assessment and deaths and suicides amongst other disability related stories.


Sources and links

The following links are to articles and websites where much of this testimony is available.

http://www.guardian.co.uk/society/2011/may/08/jobcentre-staff-guidelines-suicide-threats

http://www.bristolpost.co.uk/sister-killed-disability-benefit-stopped/story-20170841-detail/story.html


http://www.guardian.co.uk/society/2011/jul/24/atos-case-study-larry-newman

http://www.heraldscotland.com/news/home-....o-die-1.1085915

http://blogs.mirror.co.uk/investigations/2011/02/sick-who-gives-atos.html

http://www.mirror.co.uk/news/top-stories....587 5-23147158/
